

Controversy Of Form And Meaning In Donald Judd's Illustrations

Farah Mohammed Jawad¹, Hamdiya Kazem Roudan²

^{1,2} University of Babylon. College of Fine Arts.. Department of Fine Arts

¹Farah.jawad@student.uobabylon.edu.iq; ²hamdiyakadum@gmail.com

Date of publication- 14 -06-2022

I- Research problem:

As a result of the effects of the Second World War in Europe, artistic and literary currents emerged in the fifties of the twentieth century, which represented a recent artistic and literary revival, and it represented a complete revolution against the culture of enlightenment that had prevailed for a long time.

In light of this, the dialectic of form and meaning has been witnessed in many eras, since the Greek era until our time, passing through the Greek era, the European Renaissance, the Middle Ages, the era of modernity and postmodernity.

Minimalism art was one of the currents of postmodern art in which the dialectic between form and meaning of clear elements appeared, especially at the hands of one of the artists of reductionist art, the artist Donald Joe.

The problem of the current research was determined by the following question:

Did Reductionist Art witness a dialectic between form and meaning in the works of artist Donald Judd specifically?

2- The importance of research and the need for it:

The importance of the current research was to memorize the dialectic of form and meaning in the stream of reductionist art, especially in the works of the artist Donald Judd, through the following:

- Shedding light on one of the postmodern art streams and one of the most important artists of this artistic trend.

Investigating the mechanism of controversy between form and meaning in the works of one of the pioneers of reductionist art.

- The current research provides a clear reading of the concept of controversy in general and the controversy between form and meaning, especially in the abstract artistic achievement.

- The current research benefits the specialists of postmodern arts for a modest attempt by the researcher.

3- The purpose of the research:

The current research aims at the following:

Know the mechanism of the debate between form and meaning in the artworks of one of the pioneers of reductionist art, Donald Judd

4- Limitations of the search:

1- Time limits: the period from 1945-2000.

2- Spatial boundaries: Europe and America.

3- Objective limits: the dialectic of form and meaning in the stream of reductionist art of postmodern art.

5- Definition of search terms:

Dialectic: In classical philosophy:

(The lecture and the dialogue in the exchange of arguments between two parties).

(It is the concept of contradiction that accompanies the dialogue). (1)

Dialectical language:

(Dispute is a word whose root is controversy, its root is controversy, and its stem is controversy).

(A dialectic feminine noun: a noun: a feminine noun attributed to a dialectic).

(It is an industrial source of controversy: (Philosophy and Sufism)). (2)

Form: in philosophy

(It is an abstract meaning close to a form or structure).

(The Greek concept precedes linguistic expressions). (3)

Form in language:

In the dictionary of language standards:

(The ambiguous matter is the shape of the thing and its image)

(The indicative figure is said to be a woman of beautiful shape). (4)

Meaning in language:

(It is a term used by the Arabs, which means the terminology of the people of a specific art for that word, so prayer, for example, is the well-known worship).

(It is the meaning indicated by the transmission from the Arabs in the statement of a single vocabulary, such as the definition of speech as what the speaker utters with a letter and a sound). (5)

The meaning of the term:

(Speech has another meaning for the theologians in some issues of belief, such as names and attributes, and it was said that this is the speech

of the scholars of theology and the people of theology. (6)

Postmodern art:

(It was described as absurdist in which all the values that prevailed for centuries were destroyed, and Al-Bircamo described it with the following description (The universe is now devoid of logic and it is unreasonable).

(Sartre described it with the word absurd, which is the description of all the absurdity and chaos in the universe. (7)

Dickens defined it as:

(Double code, ambiguity, contradiction and ambiguity of meaning). (8)

Chapter two:

The first topic

Dialectical concepts:

It is criticism, dialogue, debate, and the beginning of controversy since the time of Plato in his philosophical dialogues, where Plato was a dialectic in an ascending dialogue and a descending dialogue in all his philosophical views, but the first beginning was in the era of the Greek philosophers (Heraclides) and (Parmenides).

With this controversy, the dialogue of science and art developed, and social and economic life developed at that time, despite the presence of many problems that occurred in response to this controversy in all walks of life. That learning began even from childhood, and according to this, the sophists played a role in it through their speeches and debating opponents in all fields. Thus, the controversy emerged, grew and developed from the widest doors.

1- Controversy in Philosophy:

In the Greek era:

It is the development of dialectics through questions of dialogue and an attempt to exclude the other party through controversy by dealing

and contrasting opinions and the presence of the opposite and the disappearance of logic.

Also that all things in nature are a set of opposites. After that, the Platonic and Sophistic philosophy, through their philosophical ideas, affected the mitigation of this controversy with this concept until it reached the modern era.

The philosophical debate in its general sense reached the era of Hegel, who called for the opposite in phenomena and access to progress. Hegel's controversy was only opposed by the controversy of science, which was built on ideas and scientific foundations (9) Dialectics or dialectics in classical philosophy, dialectics is the argument or debate: the exchange of arguments and arguments between two parties in defense of a particular point of view, and this is under the banner of logic

Dialectical materialism is the basis on which communism is built in the sense of the debate that leads to the theories and rules that govern people and conduct their political, economic and social lives (1) and dialectical materialism is the world view of the Marxist-Leninist party. It is called dialectical materialism because its approach to natural phenomena, its method of studying and understanding these phenomena is dialectical, while Her interpretation of natural phenomena, her idea of these phenomena, her theory of materialism.

The word dialectics, which we translate in Arabic as "dialectic," is derived from the Greek verb *dialegein*, which specifically means to speak "across" the space separating the interlocutors as a method of investigation developed by Zeno of Eli before it was completed by Plato (10).

For Plato, the word also means, as a Platonic concept, the logical division that leads one, through the approach, to the discovery of basic, abstract meanings (or forms).

The first dialectic is ascending (and it is the one that proceeds from concrete reality to reach the concept of good) and the argument has been defined as the method by which the mind rises from the sensible to the intelligible, without using something sensual, but by moving from meanings

to meanings by means of meanings, and that it is total knowledge With the first principles and the permanent matters, the mind reaches it after the partial sciences, then descends from it to these sciences, linking them to their principles and to the sensible things, interpreting them. So, argumentation is a method and a science, traversing all levels of existence from bottom to top and vice versa, and as it is a science, it is opposite to what we now call the theory of knowledge, meaning The broadest includes all logic and metaphysics.

- The second dialectic is regressive (in the sense that it starts from the concept of the abstract good to return to the concrete or everyday).

In Aristotle, who was opposing Plato on this point and on others, we notice a reduction in the meaning of the phrase: Analytical dialectic, which seeks to reach the real proof (in Plato), becomes mere inferences based on possible points of view (according to Aristotle).

From this Aristotelian perspective, Kant spoke in his book *Critique of Pure Reason* about the concept of "formal dialectic," by which he meant the study of the illusion in which the human soul believes that it transcends the limits of experience in order to arrive at a presumed definition of concepts related to the soul, the world, and God (11)

In the Middle Ages:

The Muslim historian and founder of sociology, Abd al-Rahman Ibn Khaldun, developed the dialectical method in dealing with historical texts in order to scrutinize them and strip them of myths and superstitions by applying reason and logic and fighting the novel, the narration and the argument.

This understanding continued to prevail in general in the Middle Ages, where dialectics meant formal logic (that is, inspired by Aristotle's analyzes) and was registered within the university trivium, i.e. outside of what was termed philosophy, accompanying grammar, morphology, rhetoric and even Some of them (such as St. Thomas Aquinas Dans Scout) linked it even with negative echoes whose repercussions

we still find today, when the word is still used to describe complex and useless analysis or discourse.

In the nineteenth century:

At the hands of Hegel, dialectic has returned to acquire a new and deep philosophical meaning, which is still prevalent until this hour: because the founder of absolute idealism made it a law that determines the course of thought and reality through the interactions of successive negation of the exposition and contradiction and the solution to the problems of existing contradictions by ascending to the universal that is quickly overcome. It is the other, and from the same premise. Thus, the "negative action" becomes part of the process, which, according to Hegel, becomes the engine of history, nature and philosophy.

Marx and Engels accept Hegel's dialectic as a method, but (as they say) "after it was lowered from heaven to earth," they apply it to the study of historical and social phenomena, and in particular to the study of economic phenomena because it is not the spirit or idea (from their perspective) that determines reality, but rather the opposite. . This was the concept later developed by the later Marxists (Klinin and Mao Zedong) who made this "dialectical materialism" a semi-integrated system of thought. (12)

In the twentieth century:

Dialectic has become meaning every thought that takes into account, in a radical way, the dynamics of historical phenomena and their contradictions.

From this standpoint, Bachelard's concept of "the philosophy of no" was a rational attempt to develop scientific concepts, which he also described as "dialectical" in order to show, in the sciences, the gradual movement of theories that were previously universally accepted, and then transcended, by including them within broader concepts and more open (eg, Newtonian mechanics and Euclid's geometry, for example, in relation to Einstein's relativity and Euclidean geometry, but not exclusively). (13)

Dialectics in science:-

Controversy in science has become one of the problems of the age, where the phenomena of the universe are observed with a direct visual look that may not be subject to controversy except in some particles. Also access to questions about the reality of these phenomena, things and visible phenomena, so that the person reaches convincing reasons for their occurrence.

Controversy in science has been characterized by convincing organizing mechanisms throughout the ages through the development of perceptions and accumulated knowledge of man and the development of means and measurement mechanisms by virtue of scientific development and the exchange of knowledge between peoples. Such as lightning, thunder, temperature changes, and the difference in weather and geography between countries, which are indisputable phenomena, but they can be contemplated backwards and the causes of their occurrence can be known.

Here, it can be said that the human being who trampled on the objects hundreds of thousands of years ago used reason, speech and scientific direction in many details of his life in those epochs filled with the mysteries of existence, where man was looking at the celestial bodies and meditating on them, which became compatible with his life over time (14)

Man is the first to discover cosmic phenomena and the first to realize the nature surrounding him and deal with it intellectually and artistically, as he crossed that with the first signs of expression, as this is the first building block in the field of human thinking.

In the modern era, the concepts of controversy, according to Başlar's opinion, were linked to the matching of science and reason, and the evolving relationship between them with the passage of time. This dialectic in Başlar had several concepts, including:

* The breadth of knowledge widely

* The development of the human mind with the development of knowledge.

*Mental structure.

* The advanced dialectic of science

The second topic

Dialectic of form and meaning in reductionist art

Reduction means either:

(a) An approach to understanding the nature of complex things by reducing them to the interactions of their parts, to simpler things or to more basic things

(b) A philosophical position that means that any complex system is nothing but the sum of its parts, and that any part of it can be reduced to parts consisting of individual basic components (15) and this can be said about things, phenomena, interpretations, theories, and meanings.

Reductionism strongly reflects a particular perspective on causation and in the reductionist framework, phenomena that can be fully explained in terms of relationships between other, more basic phenomena are called secondary (a secondary phenomenon that occurs alongside or in parallel with a primary phenomenon).

There is often an implication that the secondary phenomenon does not exert any causal force over the primary phenomena that explain it.

Reductionism does not preclude the existence of what might be called emergent phenomena, but it does require the ability to fully understand those phenomena in terms of the processes that compose them.

This reductive understanding is very different from that usually implied by the term 'emergence', which collectively means that what emerges is more than the sum of the processes from which it emerges.

Religious reductionism generally attempts to explain religion by summarizing it in certain non-religious causes. A few examples of reductive explanations for the existence of religion are: that religion can be reduced to human concepts of right and wrong, that religion is essentially a

primitive attempt to control our environments, and that religion is a way of explaining the existence of the physical world.

Anthropologists (anthropologists Edward Burnett Taylor and James George Fries) use some religious reductionist arguments and Sigmund Freud's idea that religion is nothing but an illusion is Marxism's presentation of religion as "the sigh of the oppressed" offering only "the illusory happiness of humanity's two other reducing agents." (16)

There is a certain degree of reductionism in the social sciences, which often attempt to explain entire fields of social activity as mere subfields of their own field. For example, Marxist economists often attempt to explain politics as subordinate to economics, and sociologists sometimes view economics and politics as merely sub-fields of society.

Minimal art:

Minimalism, minimalism, or minimalism is one of the currents of contemporary art that emerged in the early 1960s in the United States by the sculptors Robert Morris, Carl Andre, Donald Judd, the painters Frank Stella, Armin Olufson, and the musicians Lamont Young, Philip Glass, and Terry Riley, and Steve Reich, and they were all defined by formal abstraction, reduction and neutrality, and a perception based on the idea that improving the painting is by decreasing, reducing and deleting, so that only the core and essence remain. (17)

The goal, as emphasized by Frank Stella, one of its prominent pioneers, is that there is nothing in the painting except what can be seen, and that the works are characterized by simplicity, straight lines, and the rejection of interpretation.

They were aiming to reduce the impact of the figurative dye and the interference of the artist's hand, so most of their works were made up of two or three colors, and from basic shapes such as circles, squares and straight lines. From feelings, it has neither subjectivity nor feelings.(18)

reverse reaction:

The emergence of the movement came as a reaction to the excessive irony of Pop Art, as well as to lyrical abstraction and Abstract Expressionism, although some critics saw that it derives its roots from European geometric abstraction, especially the German Bauhaus artists, Dutch De Stil, and Russian constructivism, especially Kazimir Malevich, the most prominent representative of Russian supremacy. which appeared in 1915 and advocated pure and abstract art. Malevich, in turn, emphasized that art should be freed from any symbolic or figurative representation to become non-subjective. (19)

He followed his path, the German-American artist and theorist Ed Reinhard, whose paintings celebrate emptiness and nothingness using a single color. That is, the supporters of the movement were looking for purity and effectiveness through art, their motto, as the German Ludwig Mies van der Rohe said: "less is more." As for the name, the English philosopher Richard Walheim gave the movement in the magazine "Art Magazine" for an exhibition held for the artists of these Movement in the "Green Gallery" in New York in the fall of 1965.

In contrast to the abstract expressionists of the previous decade, who were working on subjectivity, the minimalists openly declared that their art does not express the self, because their philosophy in art is objective, and their works include geometric shapes, and sometimes cubism devoid of metaphor, with an emphasis on equality of the parties, repetition and the use of neutral spaces and industrial materials.

One of the effects of the movement's abolition of figurative, illusory and imaginative art and its replacement by the craftsman, was that it moved away from plastic art to approach sculpture, and even music. Robert Morris, one of the leaders of the movement, has been inclined to dance and choreography since discovering the music of John Cage, incorporating his ideas into works that defy the laws of nature.

As well as Wal Hanging, who dismantled the concept of sculpture, and created broad wild sculptures that derive their shape from the attraction of the earth and the environment.

Donald Judd rejected the label, although his refined style and use of industrial materials such as neon tubes make him a pioneer of minimalism.

This position brought to the minimalists the resentments of contemporary art critics and historians, who saw in their orientation as evidence of a lack of understanding of the dialectic of modern art and sculpture.

The most prominent feature of minimalism, then, is the economy in means, which gives the illusion that the artist did little to intervene, although the effect is not a simple expression, but rather is based on the engineering of space and its intelligent use, which makes it of a certain privacy, it is not a plastic art in the full meaning of the word, nor is it a sculpture, rather it is closer to a design.

In the opinion of some critics, it is difficult to define the concept of artistic impact after Donald Judd's radical assertion that the best of contemporary art is no longer in sculpture or in plastic art, as he proposed instead creating "special things" that he inserts into real space, without support, with The use of industrial materials such as steel and plexiglass. The followers of this movement, as mentioned above, focus on engineering and the use of colors. Among the special experiences:

Among the distinguished experiences, we can mention Dan Flavin, who works on neon, those bright-colored tubes that he organizes in space in an attractive way. He completed his first work in 1963, and gifted it to the Roman Constantin Brancusi, and his works are sculptures and monuments that he prepares for specific spaces.

Likewise, Karl Andre, who objects to everything that is conceptual, usually works on the horizontal and the ground, asserting that he continues to put the "endless column" formulated by Brancusi, but on the ground instead of raising it towards the sky.

Among his achievements is a flat sculpture made of metal foil connected to each other side by side, to form a rug on the floor, and that sculpture has become a place to be visited, but the most prominent of them is Frank Stella, who can be

considered the founder of the movement and the motive for its establishment since 1959.

Although his works did not receive the desired popularity, especially his works that he called "The Black Paintings", he was the first to highlight the concepts and perceptions of the movement through the abstraction, simplicity and rejection of illusionism.

Following in the footsteps of Ad Reinhard towards geometric abstraction, Stella creates paintings/objects with original skeletal shapes, highlighting straight, concentric or diagonal, regular and symmetrical lines shaped by the flat brush most often created by the artist's hand. He was among those who rejected interpretation in art, whose goal was to make the effect non-self, that is, it had nothing to do with its creator.

In addition to paintings, sculpture had an important place among the supporters of minimalism, with the adoption of the same method in economy and simplicity. Carl Andre, broad leaf folded or folded by Richard Serra, repetition of shapes and similarity of sizes by Donald Judd, modal and gravitational terrestrial pieces by Robert Morris, linear formations with white or neon-colored tubes by Dan Flavin, and blank beams with arc-shaped square-ended ends I have Albert Hirsch.

Among the characteristics of minimalist works is the selection of simple geometric volumes, free

Sample analysis:

Sample (1)

Work name: Untitled

Production Date :----

Measurement:----

Material and Material: Concrete block drawing.

Ownership: Gallery Liucastelli.

Work analysis:

This work is a diagonal square placed on a rectangular base colored in blue, arranged in a

of any tinsel, allowing colors and materials to produce things that do not have an emotional story, so that the content of the sculpture is the sculpture itself, because it is satisfied with what is essential. In addition to the tendency of minimalism to merge artistic genres, we saw this during an exhibition held at the Grand Palais in Paris in 2008, when Richard Serra placed loudspeakers around his steel works displayed, broadcasting musical notes signed by his companion Philip Glass.(20)

Chapter three

Search procedures

1- Research community:

The current research community consists of the artworks of the artist Donald Judd within the boundaries of postmodern trends, which the researcher was able to view, and it amounted to 30 artworks.

2- Sample search:

The research sample was limited to 3 artworks from the research community, which constituted 10% of the total community.

3- Search method:

The researcher adopted the descriptive method in the analytical method in analyzing her research samples.



hierarchical manner, it appears as if the perspective is upwards. There is an area for a

rectangle cut out on its right side in light white color. clear in this work.

This work is considered at the level of form and meaning with a complex dialectic, and it is a representational depiction on a single pictorial space, here the form was dominant in this monochrome work, even as it could be considered a sculptural work that was associated with reductionist art more than painting in a new style instead of returning to the old methods, whether in form or meaning.

Sample (2)

Work name: Formation of concrete.

Production Date :----

Measurement:----

Material and material: concrete.

Return: ----

Work analysis:

Concrete artwork in a formal language similar to works of visual art and in it from a clear perspective dimension.

This shape consists of square shapes arranged one above the other to the top, and in the foreground is a square colored in white as if it is not a stereoscopic work of concrete, then another square that is smaller in size, and then another miniature square that occupies the center of the last square, colored in white.

In this work, the artist Donald presented a vision and his subjective thoughts at the level of form, and ideas he expressed with inner feelings at the

Here, it can be said that this work was achieved in the escalating dialectic between form and meaning, especially that the artist Donald Judd did not give a title to this artwork, and thus expressed his self-awareness of the dialectic of the dialogue between form and meaning, which was characterized by the objectivity of forms and meaning in a new controversy and another dialogue to realize Self-presence and focus on the surfaces of shapes without meaning and with a special and absolute aesthetic portrayal and a non-diagnostic character in this artwork.



level of meaning by visually formulating the constituent forms and expressing a great rigid energy that was subject to the artist's intuitive, concrete vision in the mechanism of transforming forms and their implications.

The form came expressing a material and spiritual need at the same time to present an artistic reality in which the form became in this form and this abstract meaning with the idea of replacing symbols and a more feasible simulation in building this artwork. With a vision that can be called a recording vision of a perspective reality and a continuous dialectic between form and meaning in this work.

Sample (3)

Work name: Emotionless Art.

Production Date :---

Measurement:-

Material and material: concrete blocks.



Work analysis:

The work consists of a group of concrete blocks in the form of rectangles arranged on top of each other with clear spatial distances to suggest that the work is more like an integrated architecture. The rectangles facing the viewer are colored black, as the work consists of (9) rectangles.

The entire form suggests a pure abstraction from special plastic elements of a realistic content and an urgent necessity to realize the significance of this form.

At the level of form, it can be said that the saying of the philosopher Emmanuel Kant has been achieved in this form (pure beauty in pure form), as this work came to mimic the nature of reality in an ideal way in dealing with visual sensations as a principle and idea, as the form turned here into a fragmented essential form and portable special qualities the meaning .

As for the level of meaning, there was a complete dialectic between meaning and form due to the description of the moment and pure experimentation to reveal the meaning behind the form and the presence of the authority of sense and intuition alike for the completeness of artistic perception and the dialectic of form and meaning at the same moment and the transcendence of reality to reach beyond reality in the forms and the presence of imagination to perceive the meaning Natural symbols, but confused to the mind, and here the dialectic between form and meaning had a wide presence.

Chapter four

First:- Search results:

1- Postmodern arts formed a wide debate for controversial artistic achievements as well, especially in form and meaning as a result of the effects of the World War, which was built with marginalized forms and ambiguous meanings, especially in some postmodern currents, including reductionist art.

2- The social and situational change in Europe at that time, especially after the Second World War, led to disintegration and chaos in everything,

which created a debate between forms and their artistic meanings, especially in the works of Donald Judd.

3- The works of the artist Joud are very close to the art of sculpture and its scattered forms, which gave them an endless and unclear meaning, which led to a dialectical conflict between form and meaning in most of the works of this artist.

4- The subjective obsession, especially among the artists of reductionist art, was the present among the artistic performer, and Donald Judd's artistic works were full of subjectivity, interpretation, and retrieval in form and meaning.

Second: - Conclusions:

1- The concepts of consumption and reduction in elements and colors and at the level of form and meaning became clear in the currents of postmodern arts in general and reductionist art in particular.

2- The reductionist art was the most reductive art of postmodernism in color and less in forms, and here the artist Donald Judd dealt with monochromatic colors in his artworks.

3- The art of shorthand corresponded to the cultural and political mood of the European society at the time, especially in the art of painting, and Donald Judd was distinguished in this direction.

Third: Recommendations:

1- The reductionist art should have a distinguished place in artistic conferences and art exhibition halls because it is distinguished by reducing everything and reducing the elements at the level of form and meaning to suit the social and political conditions of the Arab society.

Fourth: Suggestions:

Aesthetics of form and meaning in postmodern currents.

Sources :

- 1- Ahmed, Mukhtar: A Dictionary of Contemporary Arabic Language, A Monolithic Dictionary of the Arabic Language, Omar, 2008.
- 2- Ibn Manzur: Lisan Al Arab / Volume 1, Beirut House for Printing and Publishing, 1955, p. 365.
- 3- Chadirji, Refaat: A Dialogue in the Structure of Art and Architecture, 1st Edition, London, 1995, p. 272.
- 4- Ibn Manzur: Lisan Al Arab / Volume 1, Beirut House for Printing and Publishing, 1955, p. 365
- 5- Fadl, Salah: The Constructivist Theory in Literary Criticism, **Farah Mohammed Jawad**¹ 3rd Edition, Department of General Cultural Affairs, Baghdad, 1987, p. 221.
- 6- Merlo, Morris: Defining Philosophy, translated by: Khoury Tarmazi, Oweidat Publications, Beirut, 1983, p. 22.
- 7- Bin Zakaria, Abi Hassan, Ahmed Bin Ghazi: Dictionary of Language Standards, Dar Al-Kutub, Cairo, 1979, p. 24.
- 8- Kamel Fouad and others: The Philosophical Encyclopedia, p. 238.
- 9- Harvey, David: The Case of Postmodernity, previous source, p. 378.
- 10- Ilyasin, Jafar: Greek Philosophers from Thales to Socrates, Library of Arab Thought, Baghdad, 3rd edition 1985, p. 77.
- 11- Imam, Abdel-Fattah: The dialectical approach, Dar Al-Thaqafa Press for Printing and Publishing, Cairo, 1981, p. 22.
- 12- Badawi, Al-Rahman: The Spring of Greek Thought, Al-Nahda Egyptian Library, Cairo, 1946, p. 47.
- 13- Al-Jabri, Ali Hussein: The Philosophical Dialogue between the Ancient Civilizations of the East and the Civilization of Greece, Iraq, Baghdad, 1985, p. 49.
- 14- Ismail Izz al-Din: Human Arts, Dar al-Ilm, Lebanon, Beirut, 1974, p. 29.
- 15- Wahba, Murad: The Philosophical Dictionary, Dar Qubaa for Printing, Publishing and Distribution, Cairo, 1998, p. 25.
- 16- Matar, Amira: Helmy Greek Philosophy, p. 191.
- 17- Karam, Youssef: History of Modern Philosophy, 1st Edition, Dar Al-Qalam, Beirut, 1977, pg. 60.
- 18- Schengler, Azold: The Decline of Western Civilization, Part 1, Translated by: Ahmad Al-Shaibanab, Al-Hayat Publications, Beirut, Without History, p. 82.

References:

- 1- Reductionism in the Interdisciplinary Encyclopedia of Religion and Science.
- 2- Classic Twentieth-Century Theorist of the Study of Religion: Defending the Inner Sanctum of Religious Experience or Storming It." Pages 176-209 in Thinking About Religion: An Historical Introduction to Theories of Religion. Malden: Blackwell, 2006.