Does Metaphysic Play Any Role In Education In View Point Of George Berkeley

Dr. Ashfaq Afzal¹, Dr. Hina Munir², Dr. Shakeela Shah³, Dr. Muhammad Javaid Iqbal⁴, Dr. Muhammad Amjad Abid⁵

Abstract

This study was conducted to determine the role of metaphysics in education. The purpose of the study, according to George Berkeley, is to learn the role of metaphysics in education, define metaphysics in education, and examine the metaphysics of idealism in education. A questionnaire was used to collect data from a sample selected through random sampling techniques. The questionnaire uses a Likert scale. SPSS software was used to find the mean, standard deviation and percentage of the product. Most of the respondents found that the teacher has an important role in the learning process, focusing on the teacher's brainstorming to get ideas and meaning through discussion, dialogue, and that the school encourages students to work together, listen, and respect others. In addition, the curriculum must include the philosophical concept of metaphysics as a theory of education. The initial stage. Curriculum should provide possibilities for conducting research and putting idealism's educational and philosophical ideas into new contexts.

Keywords: Metaphysics, Play, Role, Education

Introduction

George Berkeley (1685-1753) Bishop Berkeley, also known as an Idealist, whose main achievement is the development of a theory called "materialism". George Berkeley, a famous 18th century empiricist philosopher, advocated a philosophy called "idealism". They express metaphysics (idealism) in the principles of human knowledge and refer to and clarify the three dialogues of Hylas and Philonos.

Metaphysics is the branch of philosophy that studies the essential features of truth, the basic standards of life, identity and change, domain and

time, cause and effect, inevitability and possibility. It includes questions about the nature of focus and the relationship between thoughts and rely, depend and attributes, opportunity and reality. Metaphysics, of education that studies the remaining shape and composition of reality, this is, what's real, insofar as it's far actual. The term, which literally way "what comes after physics," is used to refer to treatises on what Aristotle himself known "first philosophy." Metaphysics has been understood in different ways in the records of Western philosophy. As a take a look at of truth as opposed to appearance. As the take a look at of the arena as a whole. And as a principle of basic principles. Some of the

¹Head Education Department Pakistan Gospel Mission <u>ashfaqafzal9@gmail.com</u>

²Assistant Professor Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Studies University of Education, Lahore hina.munir@ue.edu.pk

³Assistant Professor, Faculty of Education University of Sindh <u>Shakeela.seyed@gmail.com</u>

⁴Associate Professor of Education, Lahore Leads University (LLU) <u>javaidedu@gmail.com</u>

⁵Assistant Professor Division of Education, University of Education, Lahore, Pakistan Amajad.abid@ue.edu.pk

essential problems in the records of metaphysics are troubles of universality. This is, the query of the relationship among the nature of universality and the so-known as particularity. The life of God, mind and body issues and the nature of cloth or outside devices. Known as the oldest philosophical motion for humanity, "Human soul" as the only element in the lifestyles of that person "Immaterial" essence in its definitive attitude (Bensons, 2000). Metaphysics appears in a single-of-a-type paperwork in schooling. In terms of cosmology and theology, most faculties useful resource the idea that the universe become created by way of danger and that lifestyles advanced from little or no billions of years in the past. That is applicable to theology due to the fact most faculties both brazenly doubt the existence of God as atheists or, at excellent, are inherently agnostic. In non-Western contexts, gods and polytheism are recognized and regular in ordinary lifestyles, at the identical time as the atheistic origins of conventional technological expertise and the universe are usually taught in faculties and can purpose worldviews (Hollinger, 1986).

The main styles of metaphysical theories are Platonism, Aristotelianism, Thomism, Cartesian (see dualism), idealism, realism, and materialism. The phrase metaphysics comes from two Greek words that collectively actually suggest "after, behind, or at some stage in the examine of nature." Idealism is a metaphysical view that friend's truth with thoughts of the mind instead of material gadgets. It specializes in the intellectual or non-secular thing of experience and leaves aside the idea of cloth lifestyles. In philosophy, the time period idealism identifies and describes a metaphysical view that says that fact is indistinguishable and inseparable perception. Fact is a mental construct that is intently associated with ideas. There are at the least four subfields in metaphysics that try to cope with questions on the character of reality. Those branches Cosmology, Ontology, Anthropology, theology. Cosmology deals with

the foundation of the universe. The primary view of the beginning of the universe is that the continuum of the universe become created or designed by using God, or, at the alternative extreme, that the whole thing approximately the universe befell through danger, as is usually seen via evolution. A neutral function along this continuum. The theistic concept of evolution states that a divine getting used evolution to create the universe. Someone's ideals about cosmology affect other components of their life, their training, and the way they interpret what they revel in. For example, an atheistic scientist seems at nature and is horrified by using the random actions of natural selection to produce such splendor. But, theists see the same evidence in nature and conclude that God created stunning weather. We can't agree because we interpret what we see based on our beliefs. Ontology is the observe of lifestyles. This is probably one of the hardest situations to apprehend. However, ontologies cope with ideas including whether or not truth is physical, mental, or a combination of the two. Further, ontology deals with the order and stability of truth. People's beliefs about lifestyles can have an effect on how they method life. If there's nothing, there may be no purpose to care or do whatever. But, there's greater to existence than this, and if existence is created with reason, thinking about a way to take duty for one's movements adjustments one's conduct. Anthropology is the take a look at of humans. A number of the subjects that anthropology makes a specialty of are the relationship among thoughts and body. Is the mind or the frame the principle driver of behavior? Different questions encompass whether a person is right or horrific and morally neutral. Eventually, anthropology deals with the query of humans' freedom. Theology is the study of the nature of God and performs a crucial role in all philosophies, at the least in a roundabout way. Atheists strongly agree with that God does not exist. As such, it usually supports science as a manner of expertise truth.

Theists agree with within the life of 1 or extra gods, and this nature impacts their view of reality.

In this examine, researcher could be identifying the function of Metaphysic in schooling. In trendy, idealists have shown wonderful interest in education. Metaphysics usually agree that education should no longer simplest emphasize the development of the mind, but additionally encourage college students to awareness on all enduring values. Metaphysics about the character of the underlying ideas and fact. The concept of education is metaphysically related in many ways. (a) it's far deeply rooted in a few basic metaphysical ideas. (b) those interpretations create positive underlying realities in which they operate. (c) Invite students to have interaction in a particular understanding of the 'real' world.

The precise purpose of this take a look at is to explore the essential role of metaphysic in light of schooling gadget, highlighting idealism's intrinsic connection to the schooling. To fully recognize metaphysical idealism, it is vital to examine selected writings of outstanding philosophers who are commonly associated with this philosophy. No two philosophers agree on the entirety, so as to apprehend metaphysics. It is clever to have a look at the exclusive approaches of character philosophers in order to correctly apprehend the concept of metaphysics and the function of metaphysics in schooling device. This is executed by means of exploration George Berkeley idealism idea and his factor of view of metaphysics in education.

Literature review

Inside the ideas and the 3 dialogues, Berkeley defends metaphysical theses: idealism (the declare that the whole lot that exists is either mind or relies upon on thoughts for its existence) and immaterialism (the claim that count number does now not exist). Berkeley believed that best the perceptions of the mind and the Spirit it perceives are what certainly exist. Berkeley claims that

thoughts are derived from physical and intellectual sensations, from memory and from creativeness. The existence of a notion depends on whether it's miles viable to perceive it. A notion does now not exist except it's miles perceived. (Berkley,1765). According to George Berkeley's subjective idealism, the whole lot inside the universe is both a mind or a concept in the mind, and rely cannot possibly exist (Maden, 2021).

The trouble of instructional metaphysics is to discover the fundamental precept of harmony between nature and spirit and to show how this usual reason can be discovered and realized through the procedure of philosophy and education. It is the basis of both philosophy and training that there is an inherent reason in the universe that I accomplice thoughts with count (Kearney & Nebraska, 1914). Philosophy and training have the commonplace function of supporting human beings to understand their true worth and destiny as manifested within the ions and activities of this unifying principle. Philosophy early became a means of selfcognizance, and existence training and idea drew from its resources. If notion leads to fact, if idea is a way of self-improvement, then schooling. It should be philosophical and philosophy ought to be instructional (Berkeley, 1999; Ipaye, 1995).

Metaphysics is the science of development from sensory know-how to extrasensory know-how via with the aid of mean of motive. (Kant,1724). Academic metaphysics cope with the world connect and analyze connect and phone the inner soul of guy as a soul truth of nature and facts of training, looking for a higher order of factors, prove the strength and precept that binds him. (Herbert,1987). Metaphysics is the philosophy of fact, and educational metaphysics should approach stressful reality. In different words, our philosophy within the interpretation and explanation of training have to now not be primarily based at the molecular movements of

physical objects, but on the unifying and everlasting principles of the world. Philosophy determines what this principle is and how it pertains to humanity and the arena and training practice the standards to actual lifestyles issues round the sector. (Leibnitz, 1965). The philosophy become to hint nature, human mind and society cause inherent in a state of affairs, history or religion. (Schopenhauer, 1765; Hegel 1895, idea; & Lotze, 1760)/ consistent with Dr. Being concerned for the human heart man is a religious being, so he can know the reality. You may find yourself in that conventional concept and motive penetrate naturally. (worrying, 1987). Hegel himself says Human motive and divine cause are not absolute Human motive can apprehend due to the fact it's miles special Taking otherness in God. (Hegel, 1945).

one philosophers gave significance to schooling, because philosophy of training can be defined because the utility of philosophical thinking in educational issues. Its mirrored image is complicated, that is, as a basic detail of life. Consequently, an evaluation of one is teaching philosophy may be placed in the framework of the precept philosophies. In modern education, Plato's educational philosophy has enduring significance because of its general flourishing and harmony. His meditation takes many office work with very beneficial modifications (Klimke, Klein, & Hollinger, 1986).

Ontology is the observe of lifestyles. This is probably one of the hardest situations to apprehend. However, ontologies cope with ideas including whether or not truth is physical, mental, or a combination of the two. Further, ontology deals with the order and stability of truth. People's beliefs about lifestyles can have an effect on how they method life. If there's nothing, there may be no purpose to care or do whatever. But, there's greater to existence than this, and if existence is created with reason, thinking about a way to take duty for one's movements adjustments one's

conduct. Anthropology is the take a look at of humans

Idealism has had a tremendous impact on education. A look at the artwork reveals a bit of the rest of the verity and promotes a superior life that no other area can. Through a religious perspective, idealism can give meaning to life on earth in a trouble to remain sustainable. It presents a reality of intangibles that you enjoy but cannot see. romanticist and realist doctrines of each generally point in university classes, although they're no longer represented in the same way (Noonan, 1957).

Metaphysics is a university of instructional philosophy that makes an area of expertise of reasoning and a way to extract information from interior human beings. The arena of life is in the extraordinary human consciousness, and its concrete reality is based on the stability of the mind. Idealism seeks to determine absolute truth through common sense. As a result, all university students now have the ability to collect not only simple concepts, but also internal databases. For example, idealistic teachers look for facilitators, guides, guides, and roles that guide first grade students in reality (Klemke, Klein, & Hollinger, 1986). In this case, beginners can find the truth themselves and think freely under the strict supervision of their teachers. As a facilitator, the coach does not play an excessive authority role as a moderate guide and role model (Crooks, 1908).

Philosophers ideas about the soul of humans and morality can be summarized as complex because of the context in which he explains each of them. The soul is immortal and invisible, similar to the death of the frame and the death of the person simultaneously with separation from the soul or consciousness (Klimke, Kline, & Hollinger, 1986). But the original existence, the soul, is useless and now depends on the rest of the world, the mental sector and reality, and does not die when we are born.

Metaphysics can be divided into special colleges, in spite of the truth that for the capabilities of this have a look at each researcher are content cloth and content material to without a doubt pick out idealist not unusual assumptions. Even though idealists vary appreciably on many facts, they agree that the human soul or thoughts is the primary component of lifestyles and the universe is immaterial in nature perfect nature as properly (Baker & Morris, 1996).

The class is based on concepts or hypotheses about man's spiritual nature. The conceptual ideas of the characteristics are association, community, country, and the-circle—is presented in this reversed conception. SA: indefiniteness. The class should cover topics that are crucial to the idea of spiritual and moral improvement while still maintaining the content that is necessary for individual development. These subjects should be required for all students because they provide a way of life. Additionally, the issue needs to be stable across all bodies (Crook, 1998; 2007 Wilson; Merriam and Elias, 1980).

Berkeley, as previously stated, strikes a balance between physicalism and dualism. He achieves this middle ground by adopting significant aspects of both philosophies. He adopts the reality of mental activity from dualism. He does not attempt to reduce mentality to something that appears to be nonmetal (physical matter), as the physicalism does. Similar to dualists, he acknowledges the necessity of having two kinds of existing things ideas and mindsbut differs from dualists in that only the mind is a substance, whereas dualists believe in both mental and physical substance. He adopts the view that there is only one substance from physicalism. Importantly, he also tackles physicalism's reductionist aspect; This means that the physicalism believes that everything can be reduced to a single substance in some way. Berkeley differs in that his substance is mind, not matter; however, his thought relies heavily on this reductionist tendency.

The lecture room form and surroundings need to offer openings for university council scholars to do not forget and follow moral assessment conditions to unique design surrounds. tutoring styles ought to guide the accession of information as well as the capacity to image on those data. It is not enough to train council scholars the way to suppose (Elias, & Merriam, 1980). It's long hauls veritably vital that what scholars flash back is important; else, he will best multiply his loss of data. Training ways ought to encourage council scholars to develop their midair's; stimulate reflective wondering; inspire private moral decision- timber; offer capacities in logical wondering; offer possibilities to use data to ethical and social troubles; stimulate hobbyhorse in design content material; and inspire council scholars to correspond of the moral value of mortal civilization (McNeil, 1983; Wilson, 2007).

find trueness in the unknown through the ideas they've in their heads. A realist discovers the trueness of the world as perceived through his senses. By valuing idealism as literalism, we may gain a deeper understanding of idealism. The conception of the academy is that scholars generally tend to choose subjects that appeal to their intellect. Too numerous fantasts aren't attracted to enlisting in a particular imperative simply because they're interested in chancing a job to gain casing or in the daunting challenges of acquiring wealth and energy (Noonan, 1957).

Instructive the in regards to convictions of set consistent and complete capability essential Its. process learning/teaching them with familiar be to instructors assisting isoform liable are they what on visibly reflect to need they what perceive to is purpose the, particularly private of framework improved the in doing are. (1981, Craver & Ozmons) progress collective and reflect educators aid to merely is it, Accordingly,

Therefore. a confer to able is which concerning unmistakably think, them assist to; responsible are they what upon relations the witnessing of capable be could they/teaching the in essentials different the between, programs study, learners as such process learning, objectives learning and, management school foundation helpful in education (matters educational, 1981) (Con, 2007)

Idealism has had a tremendous impact on education. A look at the artwork reveals a bit of the rest of the verity and promotes a superior life that no other area can. Through a religious perspective, idealism can give meaning to life on earth in a trouble to remain sustainable. It presents a reality of intangibles that you enjoy but cannot see. romanticist and realist doctrines of each generally point in university classes, although they're no longer represented in the same way (Noonan, 1957).

Educational troubles and troubles are generated from life reports. The system of training itself is scientifically grounded to take an interest in life and hypothetical doable answers to troubles. still, some questions and issues in training defy medical answers. This shows that we need to appearance beyond technology to completely understand those problems if you want to give answers. As an illustration, a hassle that's principally abstract requires precis assessment in advance than it's suitable to be tried to be associated with an empirical state of affairs. This explores the vicinity of theories. As an illustration, there may be a restriction to which the lore's can train about life. One would probable discover about propositions of elaboration, the reproductive system, and mortal smash and development, among different effects, but this is generally at the extent of interpretation, and what one learns will not give enough information about actuality (Strol, 1993). At the reverse of the restatement of data are some retired trueness which is presumably taken into

consideration vital to exceptional trueness that make up information. There are retired trueness about cultures that need to be explored past empirical immolations. Notion is seen as a disposition of mind. Problems like" perception"," mind"," reality" or indeed" understanding" itself is, amongst other matters, ontological subjects that may not be effectively resolved through the empirical services of the education. They may be be metaphysical and need to explored metaphysically the operation of applicable language.

Theories offers a base for pedagogical questioning through the use of organizing information, trueness, and values as ontological realities whose nature need to be understood on the way to fete its vicinity in academic motifs (Berkeley, 1999).

Objective of the study

The targets of the examination were:

- To explore the significant role of metaphysics in education according to George Berkeley.
- To identify the metaphysical concept in education system according to George Berkeley.
- To examine the idealism metaphysics in education according to George Berkeley.

Methodology

My study is quantitative in nature and I adopted descriptive and used survey/questionnaire to gather data.

This study used a quantitative research design. A survey was used to investigate the research problem in this descriptive study. The undergraduate students of the "Faculty of Education, in University of Education, Township, Lahore" participated in the research. As a result, the questionnaire-based survey method was chosen to gather the intended data. This study was

carried out using the quantitative research method. The nature of this study was descriptive. Data were gathered through a cross-sectional survey.

The undergraduate students of the "Faculty of Education in University of Education, Township, and Lahore" comprised the study's population.

Data were collected from University of Education through random sampling technique. So sample for the study comprised a total of 100 University Students. questionnaires were distributed to the respondents. Total 46 males and 54 females returned the questionnaire.

Questionnaire is used for collection of data for this study. Questionnaire was distributed and explained to 100 students. Total 20 questions were asked in this questionnaire. Likert scale is used in the questionnaire.

The quantitative examination method was utilized for culmination of the investigation. Study was descriptive in nature. Cross sectional study for assortment of information was utilized. Cross sectional study, strategy is viewed as most fitting at whatever point a study is led to investigate the level of any develop.

The data was collected from University of Education Township Campus and hundred percent data sampled from University of Education were collected result SPSS computer program (Statistical Package for Social Science) was used to analyze the data. Data were analyzed using separate criteria. The mean and standard deviation were determined. Data was collected through questionnaires and analyzed with the help of percentage findings and recommendations were made.

Interpretation of data

It deals with data analysis and interpretation of results. A questionnaire is used as an instrument to obtain data, the data that has been collected is analyzed, shown in tables and pictures and the results are interpreted. This research was conducted to know the role of metaphysics in education. The questionnaire was distributed to the respondents. 100 questionnaires were collected from male and female students. Raw data was collected through questionnaires. A questionnaire was developed for the study on a five-point Likert-type scale. Data analysis was carried out by using SPSS, (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences) computer program. Frequency tables and figures were created to interpret the data to show the response. The researcher describes the demographics of the participants and the descriptive analysis of the data collected.

Section 1: demographic description of participants.

Numerical description of participants on the basis of gender.

Gender	Frequency	Percent	
Male	45	43.8	
Female	53	51.4	
Total	100	95.2	

This table shows that the participation of university student with respect to gender. As above table shows that out of 100 participants, 45 participants were male (43.8%), and 53

participants were female (50.8%), so it concluded that majority of the research participants were female.

Numerical	description	of	particii	oants (on i	the	basis	of	age.

Age in years	Frequency	Percent	
Below 20 years	5	4.8	
Between 20 to 25	95	90.5	
Total	100	95.2	

This table shows that the participation of university students with respect to age. As above table shows that out of 100 participants, 5 participants were below 20 years (4.8%), and 95

participants were between 20 to 25 (90.5%), so it concluded that majority of the research participants were between 20 to 25.

Numerical description of participants on the basis of education level.

Education level	Frequency	Percent	
Graduate	4	3.8	
Post graduate	67	63.8	
Other	29	27.6	
Total	100	95.2	

This table shows that the participation of university students with respect to educational level. As above table shows that out of 100 participants, 4 participants were graduated

(3.8%), 67 participants were post graduate (63.8%) and 29 participants were select the option other (27.6), so it concluded that majority of the research participants were post graduate.

Sr. No. Statement			Std. Deviation
1.	The mind/soul is the most important human organ that the school curriculum should focus on.	3.94	.951
2.	The mind/soul is the primary source of human understanding.	3.67	1.31
3.	Ideas are the ultimate goal of education and life.	4.0	.71
4.	The senses are as important as the mind when understanding.	4.20	1.02
5.	Teachers have to discuss religious perspectives with students.	4.10	1.03
6.	The school motivates students to cooperate, obey and respect others.	4.01	.989
7.	Teachers are ideal role models for their students in terms of spirit and morals.	4.20	.765
8.	The school is interested in teaching students how to respect spiritual and personal values through studying the local environment.	4.28	.682
9.	Teachers play an essential role in the educational process.	4.48	.611
10.	Teachers use lectures as a teaching method to convey real-world information to students	3.73	.951
11.	Schools preserve popular culture through education.	4.22	.894

12.	Studies of philosophy, history and art are considered as the main	4.07	.781
	subjects offered by the school.		
13.	Mathematics is a subject taught by schools to train the human mind.	4.20	1.19
14.	The role of the school is to transfer knowledge from one generation to another.	4.08	.761
15.	Educational goals ignore physical materials and focus on training the human mind	3.75	1.25
16.	When attempting to solve problems, educators employ teaching strategies like dialogue, discussion, and mental activity	4.19	.662
17.	The instructor focuses on brainstorming in order to acquire concepts and meanings through discussions and dialogue.	4.46	.500
18.	The human mind's perception of facts is more accurate than direct sensory experience.	3.88	.714
19.	The school is putting proposals and guidelines into action.	3.55	1.03
20.	School motivates students to become cooperative, obedient and respect others.	4.40	.619

This table shows the obvious highest and lowest mean values and standard deviation of student response regarding the role of metaphysics in education according to George Berkeley.

The highest mean was on item No. 9 which stated, "Teachers play an essential role in the educational process" (Mean=4.48) with (SD=0.611). The second highest mean was on item No.17 which stated, "Through discussions and dialogue, the teacher focuses on brainstorming to get ideas and meanings" (Mean=4.46) with (SD=0.501). The third highest mean in ranked was on item No.20 which stated, "School motivates students to become cooperative, obedient and respect others" (Mean=4.4) with (SD=0.619).

Conclusion:

Metaphysical concept has a great importance in education so this study conclude that the mind and soul is vital part which we focus on while making curriculum in education and also focus on reality. Developing ideas and concept among student because it is a main objective of education and life. Religious prospective is one of the main aspect of discussion between teacher and student. Through instructions, school sustain popular culture.

Recommendation:

It is based upon on the above findings:

The curriculum should have to encompass instructional philosophical principles of metaphysics as an educational concept. The preliminary stage. The curriculum should attention on presenting studies possibilities and follow the instructional and philosophical concepts of idealism in new contexts.

References:

- Berkeley, George (1988), A treatise on the principles of human knowledge. George Berkeley: The Principles of Human Knowledge and the Three Conversations between Hylas and Philonus, edited by Roger Woolhouse, New York
- 2. Heidegger, M. (2014). An introduction to metaphysics. Yale University Press.
- 3. Berkeley, George (2008), A treatise on the principles of human knowledge. In Berkeley: Philosophical Writings, Desmond M. Clark, ed., 150-67. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 4. Berkeley, George (1989), Three dialogues between Hylas and Philonus.

- George Berkeley: The Principles of Human Knowledge and the Three Conversations between Hylas and Philonus, edited by Roger Woolhouse, 115-208. New York
- Ozmon, H.A. & Craver, S.M. (1981). Philosophical foundations of education (second edition). Columbus, Ohio: Merrill Publishing Company.
- Licken, William (1996) Philosophy of Mind, in Blackwell's Companion to Philosophy, ed.
- 7. Grayling, (2005) "Berkeley's Argument Against Immaterialism". The Cambridge Companion to Berkeley, Kenneth P. Winkler, ed., 166-189. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- 8. Kim, Jagwan, (1998), "The Mind-Body Problem After 50 Years", Current Issues in the Philosophy of Mind (Royal Philosophical Institute Supplement 43), Anthony O'Hare, ed., 21-3. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- 9. Nadler, Stephen (2022) "Berkeley's Thoughts and the Distinction between Elementary and Secondary Education," Canadian Journal of Philosophy, 20, No. 1 (1990), 47-61. Accessed on

- 10. Van Etten, Richard J., (1965)
- 11. "Berkeley's Analysis of Mind,"
 Phenomenological Philosophy and
 Research (International
 Phenomenological Association).
- 12. Scolnicov, S. (2013). Plato's Metaphysics of schooling (RLE: Plato). Routledge.
- 13. Heidegger, M. (2014). An introduction to metaphysics. Yale University Press.
- 14. Berkeley, George (1989), Three dialogues between Hylas and Philonus. George Berkeley: The Principles of Human Knowledge and the Three Conversations between Hylas and Philonus, edited by Roger Woolhouse, 115-208. New York
- 15. Jagwan, (1998), "The Mind-Body Problem After 50 Years", Current Issues in the Philosophy of Mind (Royal Philosophical Institute Supplement 43), Anthony O'Hare, ed., 21-3. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- 16. Nadler, Stephen (2022) "Berkeley's Thoughts and the Distinction between Elementary and Secondary Education," Canadian Journal of Philosophy, 20, No. 1 (1990), 47-61. Accessed on