

The Depiction Of Mother's Eternal Love In Manto's Short Stories: A Psychoanalytic Literary Criticism

Rao Muhammad Umar¹, Dr. Muhammad Saeed², Dr. Syeda Misbah Rizvi³

¹Lecturer, Govt. Islamia Postgraduate College Civil Lines, Lahore

²Associate Professor, GCU, Lahore

³Associate Professor, GCU, Lahore

Abstract:

Saadat Hassan Manto is a famous Urdu fiction writer, journalist and writer. His short stories are good examples of realism. The psychology of the various roles of women in society is very well crafted in his fiction. Most of his fiction deals with the duality of society and the moral vices and ethical depravity of individuals. The role of the mother in his fiction (short stories) is the portrayal of archetype of mother's ideal and divine love. Manto's psychoanalysis and psychoanalytical literary criticism of the character's friction make it clear that this is due to his imagination and love of his mother stored in his subconscious and unconsciousness. Evidence of this love is readily found in the characters of his short stories, autobiographical notes and personal writings.

Keywords: Psychoanalysis, Literary criticism, Manto, Short stories, Characters of Mother, Archetype, Eternal love, Unconsciousness, Biographical details, Letters

Introduction of psychoanalytic literary criticism:

Psychoanalysis is defined as a set of psychological theories and therapeutic techniques which are used to treat mental disorders and psychological distresses by getting access to someone's unconscious mind and events that had influenced his/ her unconscious mind. There are several theories which are used in the psychoanalysis process, but basic theories that are related to psychoanalysis are Freudian theory (The Pre-Oedipal stage, The Oedipus Complex, The Unconscious, Ego, Id and Super-Ego), Lacanian Theory (The Mirror stage) and Object Relation Theory.

In the modern era, psychoanalysis is not simply restricted to medicine and clinical psychology. Now it is used to get a deep understanding of philosophy, sociology, culture, religion and literature. In literature, psychoanalytic literary

criticism as a literary theory or as a tool of literary criticism deals with the author's hidden or disguised motives and unconscious state of mind. This method of critiquing is an expanded form or development of the concepts and theories advocated by Sigmund Freud, Carl Gustav Jung, Alfred Adler and Otto Rank. In clinical usage these psychological theories, therapeutic techniques and methods are used for mental disorders and psychological problems. The basic difference between clinical psychoanalysis and psychoanalytic literary criticism is the difference in the subject matter. In clinical therapies, the subject matter is said individual and in literary criticism, Text is the subject matter. In Literary criticism, many psychological theories and psychoanalytic methods and concepts are utilized to get a better understanding of literature by getting access to the author's unconscious state of mind and restoring ideas of the recurrent events as a motive which motivates an author to write and

create something. "A glossary of literary terms" defines the following intentions and objectives of the psychoanalytic literary criticism tool:

"(1) reference to the author's personality to explain and interpret a literary work; (2) reference to literary works to establish, biographically, the personality of the author; and (3) the mode of reading a literary work specifically to experience the distinctive subjectivity, or consciousness of its author."(1)

This definition and defined objectives illustrate the application of these methods to the psychoanalysis of an author.

In literary criticism, psychoanalytic literary criticism has different approaches regarding text, audience and characters. These different approaches are diverse perspectives which provide a better understanding of the literature, efficiency of language and development of symbols, factors and psychological variables involved behind the creation of characters and analysis of the mentality and psyche of the audience who read it. In the process of author-centric psychoanalysis, there are several concepts which were propounded and influenced by Sigmund Freud are:

1. The primacy of the unconscious.
2. The Iceberg theory of the psyche.
3. Dreams are an expression of our consciousness.
4. Infantile behavior is essentially sexual and
5. The relationship between neurosis and creativity. (2)

Introduction and discussion:

Saadat Hassan Manto (1912-1955) is a renowned Urdu fiction writer, playwright and journalist. He portrays many psychological themes and problems like superiority and inferiority complex, childhood sexual exploration, violence and aggression, psychoanalysis and sadism and masochism in his short stories. He depicts the psyches of people belonging to different classes and

professions. He professes different roles and statuses of women in his social set-up. His fiction focuses on both individualistic and social psychology. He talks about the various prevailing roles of women in his society and presents a two-sided picture regarding these roles. Here, on the one hand, he discusses the social psychology related to these characters and on the other hand, he also discusses the psychology of these characters and the motivations that influence their psychology. If we talk about the female characters of Manto's fiction, some of them like the character of Sultana from the short story "Kali Shalwar (Black trouser)", Sughra from "Gurmukh singh ki wasiyat (Gurmukh singh's will)", Zubaida from "Aulaad (Offspring)", Nigaar from "Swaraj ke liye (For independence)", Mozel from the short story "Mozel", Stella Jackson from "Mummy", Salima from "Shah dole ka chooha (Rats of dole shah)", the character of an old mother from "Khuda ki kasam (swear to God)" are simple, traditional, loyal, keepers of the sanctity of relationships, sincere and personification of love. At the same time, some of his female characters like Kalwant Kaur from the short story "Thanda gosht (Cold Flesh)", Rukma Baii from "Parhiye kalima (Recite the Kalima)", Halakat khan from "Sarkando ke peeche (Behind the reeds)", Zahra Jaan from "Qadira qasaayi (Qairda butcher)", Salma Rehmani from "Qeemay ki bajaye bottiyañ (Pieces of flesh instead of mince)", Zainab from "Allah Dita", Jaanki from "Jaanki", Wife of Chiranji from "Jhumke (Chandelier earrings)", Bushra from "Sonoril (sleeping pills)", Lata from "Hamid ka Bacha (Hamid's Child)", and Miss Edna Jackson from the short story "Miss Edna Jackson" are cruel, immoral, insensitive, deceitful and demanding. He also presents oppressed female characters like Saugandhi from the short story "Hatak (Disrespect)", Sakina from "Khol do (Open it)", Sakina from "Paanch din (Five days)", Sughra from "Allah Dita", Shaadaan from "Shaadaan", Bimla from "Kitaab ka khulaasa (Summary of the book)", Mehmooda from "Mehmooda", Pervaiz from "Sonoril (Sleeping pills)", Nikki

from the short story "Nikki" and Nawab from "Sarkando ke peeche (behind the reeds)" are victims of social norms, injustices, bad circumstances and people's behaviour, contrary to the cruel and brutal types of characters. Some of his female characters like Chundu from Short story "Moam batti k aansu (Tears of candle)", Siraaj from "Siraaj", Shobha from "Foobha baai (Foobha prostitute)", Nikki from "Nikki", Burmi girl from "Burmi ladki from "burmi ladki (A girl from Burma), character of a prostitute from short story "Sau candlepower ka bulb (Hundred candlepower bulb)", Eidan jaan from "Qadira qasaayi (Qadira butcher)", Gangu baii from "Haarta chala gya (went on to lose), and Salma Rehmani from "Qeemay ki bajaaye bottiyañ (Pieces of flesh instead of mince)" are such a kind of nature that while reading them, the reader feels confused and thinks about whether he should hate them or pity them. He goes on to question the concepts of good and evil that thrive in society. If these female characters of Manto's stories are put together, a complete picture of the woman in society can be seen, which is the manifestation and depiction of both good and evil qualities. Criticizing Manto, some critics also accuse him of portraying a woman negatively. The main reason for this is that Manto has written a lot of fiction on the characters of prostitutes and their psychological and social problems. In the depiction of social and individualistic psychology, Manto's fiction exposes bitter and harsh realities underlying society. Manto's short story deals with the insensitive characters of society and the moral decline of society as a whole without discrimination of gender, religion and belief. There are many examples of male characters from his work that are psychopaths, dual-faced, unscrupulous and immoral, hypocritical and cruel. The character of Allah Dita from the short story "Allah Dita", Esher Singh from "Thanda gosht (Cold Flesh)", Lala Hari Charan from "Kitaab ka khulaasa (Summary of the book)", Khan Bahadur Aslam Khan from "Shaadaañ", Professor from "Paanch din (Five days)", Doctor Saeed from "Qeemay ki bajaaye bottiyañ (Pieces of flesh

instead of mince)", Santokh singh from "Gurmukh singh ki wasiyat (Gurmukh singh's will)", Taqi from "Taqi Katib (Taqi the scribe)", Khuda Bakhsh from "Kaali Shalwar (Black trouser)", Khushia from "Khushia", group of volunteers from the short story "Open it" and the characters of pimps in many short stories are examples of these such characters.

The depiction of the mother's archetype of eternal and divine love can be seen in Manto's short stories. The characters of the mother who are found in his stories are the portrayal of universal love and motherhood. Although, his fiction has many female characters which are deceitful, mischievous and immoral, wherever he depicts the character of a mother, the element of maternal love is visible. However socially and morally disliked that character may be, as a mother, she is a figure of sincerity, sacrifice and love. The main reason behind this phenomenon is the role of his mother who has a great influence on Manto's subconscious, with whom he has a deep attachment. His father had two marriages. His father had a strict nature while his mother was very soft-hearted and compassionate. About this he writes:

"Manto's fiction is a clash of two conflicting elements. His father was very strict and his mother was very soft-hearted. You can imagine in what form this grain of wheat would have come out after being crushed between these two slabs of the grindstone."(3)

This statement of Manto also helps to understand his early childhood circumstances that due to the strict nature of his father, he was more inclined and attracted towards his mother. These early conditions of his childhood and the deep impressions of his mother's love in his subconscious are also seen in the characters of mothers in his fiction. The expression and traces of this love can also be seen in the letters which he wrote to his friends and acquaintances. His biographical circumstances can also be used as evidence on this aspect. Manto's conception of a mother or the archetypal concept of mother stored in his

unconscious can be understood by Iceberg theory. Just as a small part of an iceberg floating on the surface of the water is clear and visible and the rest is submerged and invisible, like the writings of a writer and the characters he creates reflect his unconscious. It is therefore correct to say that the characters of mothers in Manto's fiction refer to his subconscious conception of his own mother. This hypothesis can be proved by his biographical circumstances and autobiographical details like his personal writings such as letters, statements, and memoirs. It is also worth mentioning here that some of his characters like Zubaydah, Salima and the old mother character are completely reflective of mother's true love and he consciously reflects the same aspects of her. Apart from this, there are many other characters in his fiction, such as the characters Nikki and Shaarda, who are created as immoral and disliked characters in various social and moral contexts, but when he portrays the same characters as mothers, He unconsciously portrays them as figures of sincerity and sacrifice. This aspect can also be understood with the help of the psychoanalysis technique Freudian slip or parapraxis. According to Freudian slip and parapraxis, man unconsciously articulates his unconscious part spontaneously or mistakenly. Or while talking or writing about a topic, the events, accidents or concepts stored in his unconscious or subconscious dominate him and he starts to describe his Unconscious or subconscious details related to the subject. The character of Niki and Shaarda are good examples of this. In this regard, these personal letters and the references to autobiographical notes are also of special importance, which is proof of Manto's love for his mother.

Autobiographical References:

Here are autobiographical References from his letter written to his friends and from his writings about his life:

In his letter to Ahmad Nadeem Qasmi dated 24 February 1940, he wrote:

“I'm good. Mother is not feeling well for some days. So I am very worried.”(4)

In his letter to Ahmad Nadeem Qasmi dated 1 April 1940, he wrote:

“I got your kind letter. I have been very worried for a few days. Nazir had gone to Delhi. Therefore, all the work in the office was my responsibility. Then the day after yesterday, mother fell in the bathroom and broke her wrist.” (5)

There are also some references in his writings, which depict the state and feeling of deep sorrow on the death of his mother. In his letter to Ahmad Nadeem Qasmi dated June 1940, he wrote:

“I got your kind letter. Thanks for the sympathy. Soon after Bibi Jan's death (he called his mother with this name), my health deteriorated. And for eight days I had a fever of 104 degrees. Now by the grace of God, I am feeling good, but due to extreme weakness, severe pain in the chest has started for which I couldn't find any relief. May Allah bless you. (6)

In his letter to Ahmad Nadeem Qasmi dated 23 September 1940, he writes:

“I got both of your affectionate letters. As I was unwell, I could not send their receipt. Firstly, the climate here was not favorable for me and secondly, some adverse events especially the sudden death of my mother, have traumatized me physically and spiritually. Yesterday I had a fever of 105 degrees.”(7)

In his letter dated 26 June 1939 to Ahmad Qasmi, he describes his grief in these words:

“Be sure to write to Krishn Chander that my mother has died. I will hand over to them what leisure I get from mourning her.”(8)

In his autobiographical note “Meri Shadi (My marriage)”, he also describes and depicts the state of sorrow and immense grief on the death of his mother:

"I have only fainted three times in my life. First time when I was inviting Syed Fazal Shah (deceased) to attend my marriage. The second time, this happened on the sudden death of my mother and the third time on the death of my son."(9)

Indication from mother characters depicted in short stories:

A psychological analysis of mother roles in Manto's short stories also supports this statement. Psychoanalytic literary criticism examines the motivations and factors influencing the author's subconscious and leading him to create characters. Some of the mother roles in his fiction (short stories) like Zainab from the Short story "Aulaad (Offspring)", Salima from "Shah dole ka chooha. (Rats of dole shah)", character of old mother from "Khuda ki kasam (swear to God)" are associated with the archetypes of motherly love and characteristics such as simplicity, domesticity, loyalty, sacrifice, and sincerity. While some characters like Shaarda from short story "Shaarda", Nikki from "Nikki", Chiranj's wife from "Jhumke (Chandelier earrings)", Shobha from "Foobha baai (Foobha prostitute)" and Chundu from short story "Moam batti ke aansu (Tears of candle)" are the image of immorality and disloyalty in social terms, the same characters are sincere and selfless towards their children. These characters at the same time, in the form of a mother, are symbol of maternal love. Some of these mother characters from his stories are discussed below:

An Old mother (10):

The story is about an ill-fated mother whose young daughter is separated from her during partition and she goes mad with this grief. That crazy woman, forced by her maternal love, goes around frantically searching for her daughter. The author tries to convince her that her daughter died in the riots of partition but she does not believe him. One day the mad woman saw her daughter Bhaag Bhari with her Sikh husband in a market, but the daughter refused

to recognize her mother. The author, who was watching the whole incident, assured her by swearing to God that her daughter had died and the woman she just saw there is not her daughter. On hearing this she dies on spot. Manto describes her feeling in these words:

"I thought: A useless search and then delusion! But why was the madwoman so sure that no sabre could rise on his daughter, no sharp edge or blunt knife could reach her neck? Was she immortal or her motherliness was immortal? Maternal love is eternal. Then was she looking for her motherliness? Did she lose it somewhere?"

Salima (11):

The character of Salima from short story "Shah dole ka chooha (Rats of dole shah)" is also an image of maternal love. This short story also examines the fabricated system of false beliefs that flourishes in society and its negative effects on the life of the common man. Salima was married for five years but no children were born to her. An acquaintance of hers told her about Shah Dole's shrine and that she would have a child if she took a vow there, but the condition was that Salima would have to leave her first child at the shrine as an offering. After some time Salima gives birth to a baby boy. Due to this Vow, she unwillingly gives up her first child Mujeeb under this belief. But she kept her grief close to her chest and never forgets her child. This sorrow makes her physically and mentally sick. Time passes and she gives birth to a daughter and two sons, but she fails to forget the grief of her first son. After a period, one day when Mujeeb arrives at her door as a rat of Shah Dole, Salima recognizes him immediately and takes him from the showman for five hundred. But when she returns inside with the money, Mujeeb has disappeared. A dialogue between Salima and her husband depicts the mother's heavenly love and concern for her child in these words:

"When Salima's fever subsided and the storm of her heart and mind cooled down, Najib said to

her, "My dear! Forget your child. It was for charity.

Salima said in a hurt tone, "I don't believe." For the rest of my life, I will continue to curse my motherhood that why have I committed such a big sin that I handed over my liver to the attendants of the shrine? They cannot be a mother."

Zubaida (12):

The character of Zubaida from the short story "Aulaad (offspring)" shares a multidimensional framework about an infertile woman who couldn't give birth to a child. This short story shares many social and psychological issues regarding such cases. The demanding behavior of society and In-laws from such women disturbs her psychology. The character of Zubaida depicts many psychological issues and schizophrenic behaviors. Sometimes she hears the sound of a weeping child. Her husband asks his friend to give his newborn child to him because he had several children before this coming baby. He told Zubaida that is pregnant and she starts believing this. After some time her husband brings his friend's newborn baby and puts that baby beside his sleeping wife. When she awakes he told her that their fifth child is just born. Next day when her husband returns from work he sees that Zubaida's clothes are wet with blood. She said that baby is crying with hunger for the whole night and she is not able to breastfeed her child. My breasts are useless so I have cut them with a razor. Due to immense blood flow, she dies.

Shaarda (13):

The character of Shaarda from Manto's short story "Shaarda" also portrays maternal love and affection. Shaarda is a single mother of a one-year-old baby girl name Munki. Her husband left her for no reason and without any notice. She comes to Bombay (new name Mumbai) to meet her sister Shakuntla. Shakuntla is a sex worker who works with a pimp Kareem. Nazir is Kareem's old customer who is addicted to prostitution. Kareem told him about Shaarda and that she is a tough nature woman but if he

can manage to agree her to spend some time with him, he can. Nazir shows love and sympathy towards Shaarda's daughter, which makes her soft, touchy and kind towards Nazir.

Nikki (14):

The character of Nikki also depicts a mother's role and her sacrifices for his daughter Bholi. In the short story "Nikki", Manto tells the story of a woman whose husband Gaam used to beat her all the time. She wants to separate from her husband but he doesn't allow her. After ten years of being humiliated and beaten, finally he divorced her at the request of a prostitute. This humiliation makes Nikki aggressive and truculent. She started arguing and quarrelling with her neighborhood. The women in the neighborhood started paying her for arguing on their behalf. Besides this aggression and her role hard role in society, she seems much more concerned about her daughter even on her deathbed. Although everyone thinks that she is rigid and aggressive but her soft corner toward her daughter portrays her idealistic role as a mother and her maternal love for her daughter.

Chundu (15):

In this short story "Moam batti k aansu (Tears of candle)", Chundu is a poor woman who works as a prostitute. She has a daughter named Laajo. She wants to fulfill her daughter's wishes. At the beginning of the story, her daughter asks her for a necklace, and to fulfill her daughter's wish, she makes a necklace out of the melted drops of a candle. At the end of the story, Chundu decides that her daughter will not live such a life and removes the necklace from her neck. A candle that melts drop by drop throughout the night can also be seen in this myth as a symbol of the life of a prostitute.

Shobha (16):

In this short Foobha Baai (prostitute), there is also a depiction of a prostitute named Shobha. She sends two hundred rupees to her son every month through prostitution. After some time her son dies and she disappears from the scene. After some time, people see him in a pitiful and

sickly state. She is addicted to drugs (morphine). His body becomes dry and his face turns yellow. She says that in my dark life there was only one light that was also extinguished by God. She goes around searching for her son like crazy and bears the sorrow of his motherliness. For her, the purpose of living is lost.

Chiranji's wife (17):

In this short story "Jhumke (Chandelier earrings), the character of Chiranji Tanga (horse carriage or gig) coachman's wife is presented as a greedy and unfaithful woman. Who cheats on her husband with the lure of gifts and gold ornaments and develops a physical relationship with her rich neighbour. Poor Chiranji buys chandelier earrings for her with his hard-earned money, and then he sees his wife bringing chandelier earrings from her neighbour. He leaves her with his daughter, at which his wife cries and wails. His wife later becomes a prostitute. After a long time, while she was drunk and going somewhere, by chance, she learns that her daughter Krishna Kumari (Chiranji and her daughter) is getting married. Her maternal love wakes up. She calls her daughter and tries to meet her. Chiranji takes him on his tanga and drops the tanga into the ditch.

Saugandhi (18):

Sugandhi's character from short story "Hatak (Disrespect)" also expresses some shades of maternal love. Sugandhi is a prostitute who is insulted by one of her clients. He sees her and says hunh arrogantly and disgustingly and leaves her. She feels humiliated by these comments about her. This rejection and humiliation affect her psychology badly. She wants to take revenge on him but can't. In the end, she takes her dog suffering from scabies in her lap and lies on the bed. This is also a glimpse and shade of maternal love hidden within her

Conclusion:

The Role of the mother in Manto's short stories is the personification and archetype of divine and universal true love. The reason behind this phenomenon is the involvement of his feeling of love and affection for his mother which he consciously or unconsciously depicts in these characters. These characters and the autobiographical details in his writings and letters indicate his affection towards his mother and his concern for her. After psychoanalysis of his writings and analysis of the characters depicted in his short stories on the grounds of psychoanalytic literary theories, this statement can easily be proved that his short stories portray the character of the mother as the symbol of purity, sacrifice and eternal and unconditional love.

References:

- 1- Abrams, M. H., & Harpham, G. G. (2015). A glossary of literary terms (11th ed.). Cengage Learning. P-319
- 2- https://globaljournals.org/GJHSS_Volume17/3-Psychoanalytic-Theory-used.pdf
- 3- <https://www.rekhta.org/khaka/manto-saadat-hasan-manto-khaka?lang=ur>
- 4- Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi ed. (1966). Manto Ke Khatut, Rawalpindi: Kitaab Numa. P111
- 5- Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi ed. (1966). Manto Ke Khatut, Rawalpindi: Kitaab Numa. p114
- 6 -Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi ed. (1966). Manto Ke Khatut, Rawalpindi: Kitaab Numa. p122
- 7 -Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi ed. (1966). Manto Ke Khatut, Rawalpindi: Kitaab Numa. p149
- 8- Hassan, Professor Muhammad, 1982, Saadat Hassan Manto: Apni takhliqāt ki Roshni me", Darul Isha'at taraqi Delhi, p11.
- 9- Manto, S. H. (1990). Manto Rama. Sang e Meel Publishers. P-284

- 10- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/khuda-ki-qasam-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
- 11- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/shaah-doole-ka-chooha-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
- 12- <http://dil-kidunya.blogspot.com/2017/04/aulad-urdu-short-stories-bysaadat-hasan.html?m=1>
- 13- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/shaarda-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
- 14- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/nikki-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
Manto, S. H. (1985). Life and works of Saadat Hassan Manto. (Tahira Naqvi, Trans.). Vanguard books Lahore.p167
- 15- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/mombatti-ke-aansu-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
- 16- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/foobha-baai-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
- 17- <https://www.rekhta.org/stories/jhumke-saadat-hasan-manto-stories?lang=ur>
- 18- <https://www.rekhta.org/drama/hatak-saadat-hasan-manto-drama?lang=ur>
4. Irfan, Shehzada (Ed.). (2016). The great Manto. Bookage Lahore.
5. Jalal, A. (2013). The pity of partition: Manto's life, times, and work across the India-Pakistan divide. Princeton University Press.
6. Jalal, Ayesha, & Jalal, Nusrat (Eds.). (2012). Manto. Sang-e-meel publications Lahore.
7. Lynn, Steven. Texts and Contexts: Writing About Literature with Critical Theory. 2nd ed. NY: Longman, 1998.
8. Manto, S. H. (1985). Life and works of Saadat Hassan Manto. (Tahira Naqvi, Trans.). Vanguard books Lahore.
9. Manto, S. H. (1997). Mottled Dawn: Fifty Sketches and Stories of Partition. (Khalid Hussaini, Trans.). Penguin Books India.
10. Manto, S. H. (2000). Manto Panorama. (Khalid Hussain, trans.). Sang-e-meel publications Lahore.
11. Manto, S. H. (2000). Manto's World. (Khalid Hussain, trans.). Sang-e-meel publications Lahore.

Works Consulted

1. Abrams, M.H. "Psychological and Psychoanalytic Criticism." A Glossary of Literary Terms. 7th ed. Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace College Publishers, 1999. 247-253.
2. Biddle, Arthur W., and Toby Fulwiler. Reading, Writing, and the Study of Literature. NY: Random House, 1989.
3. Freud, Sigmund. "On Dreams." Excerpts. Art in Theory 1900-1990. Ed. Charles Harrison and Paul Wood. Cambridge: Blackwell Pub., Inc., 1993. 26-34.
12. Manto, S. H. (2008). Bitter fruit: The very best of Saadat Hasan Manto (K. Hasan, ed. and Trans.). Penguin Global.
13. Manto, S. H. (2012). Manto: Selected short stories: Including 'Toba Tek Singh' and 'The dog of Titwal'. Vintage.
14. Manto, S. H. (2015). Black Milk. (Hamid Jalal, trans.). Sang-e-meel publications Lahore.
15. Manto, S. H. (2018). Manto Revisited. (Amir Rizvi, trans.). Ferozsons.

16. Manto, S. H. (2018). Manto Saheb: Friends and enemies on the great maverick. (Vibha Chauhan and Khalid Alvi, trans.). Speeding Tiger Publishing New Delhi.
17. Murfin, Ross, and Supriya M. Ray. (1997) The Bedford Glossary of Critical and Literary Terms. Boston: Bedford Books,.
18. Shajar, Shamsheer Haider, & Alhasan, Naveed (Eds.). (2005). Sa'adat Hassan Manto (pachās sāl bad). Urdu department Gc University Lahore.